TODAY’S CRITICAL MINERAL TECHNOLOGIES
AND HOW TO MOVE FORWARD

November 30, 2022
THANK YOU TO OUR SPONSORS

Industrial Commission of North Dakota
Lignite Research, Development and
Marketing Program

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY

NATIONAL ENERGY TECHNOLOGY LABORATORY

BASIN ELECTRIC POWER COOPERATIVE
A Touchstone Energy® Cooperative

BNI ENERGY
AN ALLEGI CO COMPANY

Current

Minnkota Power Cooperative
A Touchstone Energy® Cooperative

NORTH AMERICAN COAL CORPORATION
PRESENTERS

**John Kay**, Principal Engineer
Emissions and Carbon Capture, EERC

**Nolan Theaker**, Technical Group Manager
Critical Minerals, Institute for Energy Studies
Webinar Series Events

Critical Minerals: What, How, Why All the Hype?
September 21, 2022

Today’s Critical Mineral Technologies and How to Move Forward
November 30, 2022
Webinar Series Events

- Critical Minerals: What, How, Why All the Hype?
  September 21, 2022

- Today’s Critical Mineral Technologies and How to Move Forward
  November 30, 2022

- Why Do Critical Mineral Business in the Williston Basin?
  Our Strengths, Our Assets, Our Needs
  January 11, 2023
Webinar Series Events

**Critical Minerals: What, How, Why All the Hype?**  
September 21, 2022

**Today’s Critical Mineral Technologies and How to Move Forward**  
November 30, 2022

**Why Do Critical Mineral Business in the Williston Basin?**  
**Our Strengths, Our Assets, Our Needs**  
January 11, 2023

**Securing the Williston Basin’s Critical Mineral Future:**  
**Findings and Next Steps**  
March 2023
Defining Critical Minerals

Critical Minerals

Rare-Earth Elements (REEs)
- Not rare but found together.
- Chemically similar and difficult to separate.
- Each has a different use.

Critical Minerals (CMs)
- Catch-all term for the critical minerals that are not REEs.
- No other common factor.
Critical Minerals Play a Vital Role in Our Modern Economy and National Security
The United States is more than 80% reliant on imports.
Elements with Greatest Potential to Contribute to the Williston Basin Market
Developing New Sources and Innovative Ways to Extract CMs and REEs

Existing Lignite Coal Mines

Produced Water

ND Shales: Pierre, Niobrara, Upper and Lower Bakken

Coal Ash

Deep Unminable Coal Seams by In Situ Extraction
Technologies for CM Extraction and Use

Nolan Theaker
Technical Group Manager, Critical Minerals
Institute for Energy Studies
Questions to Answer

• Why do we need new technology?
• How can we extract CMs?
  – Coextraction
  – Metallurgy
• What technologies do we use in the supply chain?
  – Case study: REEs from lignite
• How do we move forward with CMs?
Why Do We Need New Technologies?

• Ore grade (how rich a source is) usually goes down.
  – If processing cost linearly increased with grade, no mining would occur.

• Production rates dictate a scalable process for mining and extraction.
  – Rates of CM use are increasing.
New Technologies for More Production

Production increasing
- Meet climate goals
- Meet computer and electrification needs

Production for some elements will need to increase by many times the current rate.
New Technologies to Reduce Environmental Impact

• Making value from wastes:
  – Coal ash
  – Produced water
  – Acid mine drainage

• Use more benign processes:
  – Less chemicals = less spill risks.
  – Less toxic chemicals = less safety risk.

• Use more energy-conscience methods:
  – Lower power/fuel requirements
New Technologies to Use Unconventional Ore

Can access new ores previously unexplored:
- May have lower content but be in a more accessible form.
- Coproduct options and/or reducing environmental impacts of other resources.

May generate business benefits to using unconventional (reduced permitting).

Examples:
- REEs/CMs from coal – built-in by-product
- Lithium and magnesium from produced water – reducing an environmental burden and paying for it
Goals of Extraction Dictate Technologies to Employ

• Form of the ore matters:
  – Easier/harder to extract
  – More/less harmful impurities

• Also important: whether the CM is the dominant economic interest:
  – Most CMs are by-products from other processes.
  – Benefits from joint processing.
How Does Coproduction Make CMs Possible?

• Many CMs are too rare/dilute to recover individually.
  – On the order of a teaspoon per ton

• If the CM exists with another mineral you can extract, it reduces cost.
  – Done with copper, aluminum, and iron
    ♦ World’s largest producer of REEs comes from an iron mine: Bayan Obo

Image from Bruker
Case Study: Gallium (Ga)

- Used in solar cells, LEDs
  - Market isn’t going down; more is needed.

- Average content of 18 parts per million
  - Very difficult to extract economically alone.
    ♦ Teaspoon per ton – (actually ¾ teaspoon)

- Aluminum (Al) processing concentrates Ga
  - 10x more concentrated.
  - In a solution form due to dissolving Al.
  - Essentially all of Ga in the world comes as a by-product from aluminum processing.
Extractive Metallurgy

Mineral Processing
Physical processing of minerals

Hydrometallurgical
Use of liquid solvents to extract and separate the CM of interest

Pyrometallurgical
Use of temperature/pressure to separate minerals

Electrometallurgical
Use of electricity for separation and/or processing
Mineral Processing

Physical processing and handling of the constituent minerals

- Size classification
  - Crushing
  - Grinding
  - Screening

- Use of physical parameters for separation
  - Density
  - Ability to grind (hardness)
  - Wettability

RP-4 Shaker Table for Gold
Examples of Mineral Processing

- Gold panning: a form of crushing, screening, and density separation
- Pulverizing coal for combustion
- Mineral-concentrating spirals
- Not applicable to solution ores such as produced water or brines

Coal pulverizers from Babcock and Wilcox

Image from Shore Excursions Group
Hydrometallurgy

Use of solvents, acids, and bases to separate CMs from other materials

Pros

• Liquids can be moved around easily.
• Many separation methods exist in liquids.

Cons

• Environmental effects of water use.
• Costly/hazardous chemical use.
• Essentially impossible to form metals.
Examples of Hydrometallurgy

• Nature uses hydrometallurgy to make minerals.
  – Calcite → Limestone
  – Pyrite formation
  – Capture of REE ions by lignite (theory)

• 70 elements made possible by hydrometallurgy.
  – Leaching of copper started in the 1200s.
Use of thermal and pressure processes to separate materials.
• Using heat to chemically or physically alter a material.

Pros
• Little to no dependence on a chemical.
• Many possible sources of heat available.

Cons
• Not a robust separation method.
• Moving hot, molten metal is difficult.
Examples of Pyrometallurgy in CMs

• Iron/steelmaking – Mixing coke (carbon-rich coal) with iron ore to form pure iron metal.

• Germanium, gallium, and titanium all use a chlorine-based pyrometallurgy process for purification.
  – Mix ore with Cl₂ gas, heat, then boil the CM-chloride.
Electrometallurgy

Use of electrical potential to chemically alter and/or separate materials
• Very often is, but does not need to be direct electric use.

Pros
• Can and is used to metallize virtually all metals.
• Little to no environmental impact.

Cons
• Very susceptible to certain impurities.
• Can be very high electric demand.

Image from Goldgenie
Examples of Electrometallurgy in CMs

- Silver and gold plating on silverware
  - Electrodeposit precious metal on a metallic, conductive base (typically brass/copper)

- Act of making metals for over 30 elements
  - REEs included
  - Aqueous metallization for a select few
  - Molten salt metallization for most
Definitions

Supply Chain

- *Merriam Webster* – “The chain of processes, businesses, etc., by which a commodity is produced and distributed.”

- *Investopedia* – “a network of companies and people that are involved in the production and delivery of a product or service.”

- For mineral processing, this doesn’t typically include distributors in the equation, more so the processes required.
Mining Technologies

Process of getting high-value ore to surface including:

- Exploration technologies
- Ore extraction technologies/methods
- Online/belt analysis/sorting technologies
Ore Concentration

• Making a valuable component in a dilute ore more pure
  – Product not purity or form of final product
  – <5% ore to >90% concentrate
  – Removing impurities that are challenging to refine

• Physical and chemical means of ore concentration
  – Commonly both methods combined for a single processing method
  – Process designed for the feedstock

Image Credit: Mineral Technologies
• Separating: Generating a high-purity material (may not be in the right form):
  – Example: separating mixed REEs into individually pure forms
    ♦ Many separation approaches exist.

• Ore feedstock only somewhat affects the processing technology.
  – Certain impurities not amenable with certain technologies.
Processing

- Processing – Converting the high-purity material into a usable form:
  - Example: Making metals from oxides or salts, or carbon fibers from pitch
  - Typically, does not involve substantive purification.

- Typically, ore-feedstock-agnostic.
  - Purity set by downstream, met by upstream.
Manufacturing

Making the products that we use and need

• Generally marketable products
  – Products that are salable in many industries/final products
  – Magnets and electrical components
  – Graphite, carbon fibers, etc.

• Process may become feedstock-conscious again:
  – Nontechnical but for business
  – Buy American, ESG
Case Study: REEs from Lignite (mines)

- REEs typically concentrated at the tops/bottoms of seams
  - Explore for REEs throughout the mine area
  - Remove during the current mining plan
  - Remove with surface miners for thin seams/layers

- Separate from the combined coal stream
  - Analyze and separate using on-belt sorting

Image Credit: Lignite Energy Council – Falkirk Mine
Case Study: REEs from Lignite

• Ore concentration – hydrometallurgy
  – Extracting the REE from an ore using an acid
    ♦ Concentrated – conventional ores
      - Monazite in coals
    ♦ Dilute – unconventional ores
      - Organic-bound in lignites
  – Precipitating REEs as a solid
    ♦ Some form of REE-salt
• Calcining – pyrometallurgy
  – Converting the salt to an oxide
Case Study: REE Separation

Two main paths:

• Hydrometallurgy
  – Solvent extraction with organics
  – Ion-exchange extraction
  – Impurities must be constant but can generally tolerate most.

• Electrometallurgy
  – Electrowinning of individual REEs
  – Impurities can vary, but some may be process-killing.

Image Credit: SoS Rare Metals
Case Study: REE Metallization and Alloying

Two main paths:
- Electrometallurgy – current global leader in producing
  - Major environmental controls needed
- Pyrometallurgy
  - Metallothermic reduction with another, more easily electrically formed metal
  ♦ Separating the metals can be tricky.
How Do We Move Forward?

Evaluate technologies with:

• Ore and reserve in mind
  – Type, impurities, grade, size
  – Is coproduction possible?

• Current technology scale
  – Is this commercial and trusted?
  – Is this a decade away, but could make impacts?

• Market needs
  – Does this produce the products the market demands (now/future)?
How Do We Move Forward – Really?

Business questions – risk/benefit analysis

• Do we take a $1B risk on a new technology that could be better?
• Do I simplify my process to make one to two products instead of many?
  – Will those products always make me money? (REEs)
  – Which product is the primary?
  – Which product comes first?
  – Who is my buyer and what do they want?
Summary/Takeaways

Why do we need new technology?
• Ore grade and production rates

How can we extract CMs?
• Coextraction with a major
• Review of extractive metallurgy

What technologies do we use in the supply chain?
• Mining → Manufacturing techs
• Case study – REEs from lignite

How do we move forward with CMs?
• New techs and business challenges
Carbon Ore, Rare Earth, and Critical Minerals Initiative (CORE-CM)

U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) National Energy Technology Laboratory (NETL)-Led Program

- Catalyze economic growth.
- Job creation in energy communities.
- Energy communities not to be left behind.
- Domestic production of REEs and CMs.
- Strengthen our national economy and security.
Williston Basin CORE-CM Project Team

UN D Energy & Environmental Research Center
UN D Institute for Energy Studies
UN D Nistler College of Business & Public Administration
Pacific Northwest National Laboratory
North Dakota State University
Montana Tech University
Critical Materials Institute (Ames)
Basin Electric Cooperative
BNI Energy
Current Lighting Solutions
General Atomics
Illinois Geological Survey CORE-CM Team
Lignite Energy Council
Minnkota Power Cooperative

NDIC Lignite Research Program
North American Coal
North Dakota Department of Commerce
North Dakota Geological Survey
North Dakota Governor’s Office
Northrup Grumman
Semplastics
South Dakota Geological Survey
U.S. Geological Survey
University of Alaska CORE-CM Team
University of Utah CORE-CM Team
Western Dakota Energy Association
Wyoming School of Energy Resources CORE-CM Team
ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This material is based upon work supported by the U.S. Department of Energy National Energy Technology Laboratory under Award No. DE-FC26-05NT42592.

DISCLAIMER

This presentation was prepared as an account of work sponsored by an agency of the United States Government. Neither the United States Government, nor any agency thereof, nor any of their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the United States Government or any agency thereof. The views and opinions of authors expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the United States Government or any agency thereof.
NDIC DISCLAIMER

This report was prepared by the EERC pursuant to an agreement partially funded by the Industrial Commission of North Dakota, and neither the EERC nor any of its subcontractors nor the North Dakota Industrial Commission nor any person acting on behalf of either:

(A) Makes any warranty or representation, express or implied, with respect to the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of the information contained in this report, or that the use of any information, apparatus, method, or process disclosed in this report may not infringe privately owned rights; or

(B) Assumes any liabilities with respect to the use of, or for damages resulting from the use of, any information, apparatus, method, or process disclosed in this report.

Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the North Dakota Industrial Commission. The views and opinions of authors expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the North Dakota Industrial Commission.
Webinar Series Events – Watch Your Email for Future Invites!

January 11, 2023

Securing the Williston Basin’s Critical Mineral Future: Findings and Next Steps
March 2023

Visit us online!
- Learn more about the Williston Basin CORE-CM Initiative.
- Listen to past webinars and presentations.

www.undeerc.org/wb-corecm (or scan the QR code)
Questions?